

1 **BURSOR & FISHER, P.A.**

2 Scott A. Bursor (State Bar No. 276006)  
3 L. Timothy Fisher (State Bar No. 191626)  
4 Annick M. Persinger (State Bar No. 272996)  
5 1990 North California Boulevard, Suite 940  
6 Walnut Creek, CA 94596  
7 Telephone: (925) 300-4455  
8 E-Mail: scott@bursor.com  
9 ltfisher@bursor.com  
10 apersinger@bursor.com

11 *Co-Lead Class Counsel*

12 **NORTON ROSE FULBRIGHT US LLP**

13 Jeffrey Margulies, State Bar No. 126002  
14 Spencer Persson, State Bar No. 235054  
15 Stephanie Stroup, State Bar No. 235071  
16 Jade Jurdi, State Bar No. 273401  
17 555 South Flower Street  
18 Forty-First Floor  
19 Los Angeles, CA 90071  
20 Telephone: (213) 892-9200  
21 E-Mail: jeff.margulies@nortonrosefulbright.com  
22 spencer.persson@nortonrosefulbright.com  
23 stephanie.stroup@nortonrosefulbright.com  
24 jade.jurdi@nortonrosefulbright.com

25 *Attorneys for Defendants*

26  
27  
28  
**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

29 ENZO FORCELLATI and LISA  
30 ROEMMICH, on Behalf of Themselves  
31 and all Others Similarly Situated,  
32  
33 Plaintiffs,

34 v.

35 HYLAND'S, INC., STANDARD  
36 HOMEOPATHIC LABORATORIES,  
37 INC., and STANDARD HOMEOPATHIC  
38 COMPANY,  
39  
40 Defendants.

Case No. 2:12-CV-01983 GHK(MRW)

**[PROPOSED] PRELIMINARY  
APPROVAL ORDER**

Hon. George H. King

1           The parties in the above captioned action, including Plaintiffs Enzo Forcellati  
2 and Lisa Roemmich on the one hand, and Defendants Hyland's, Inc., Standard  
3 Homeopathic Laboratories Inc., and Standard Homeopathic Company on the other,  
4 have reached a Settlement Agreement that is set forth in the Stipulation of Settlement  
5 filed with this Court.

6           Pending before the Court is the parties' Motion for Preliminary Approval.  
7 Having carefully reviewed the Stipulation of Settlement, including the exhibits  
8 attached thereto and all papers, pleadings, records, and prior proceedings to date in  
9 this Consolidated Action, the Court GRANTS Preliminary Approval and FINDS and  
10 ORDERS as follows:

11           1.       As an initial matter, for purposes of this Preliminary Approval Order,  
12 except as otherwise indicated herein, the Court adopts and incorporates the  
13 definitions contained in the Stipulation of Settlement.

14           2.       The Settlement Agreement set forth in the parties' Stipulation of  
15 Settlement is within the range of reasonableness and possible final approval in that it  
16 appears fair, reasonable, and adequate. The parties' Agreement was reached as a  
17 result of extensive arm's length negotiations between the parties and their counsel.  
18 This included five full day mediation sessions, the first two with Robert A. Meyer of  
19 Loeb & Loeb LLP, and the final three with the Hon. Jay C. Gandhi, United States  
20 Magistrate Judge. Additionally, before entering into the Agreement, this Action was  
21 on the eve of trial. Thus, Plaintiffs and their counsel had sufficient information to  
22 evaluate the strengths and weaknesses of the case and to conduct informed  
23 settlement discussions.

24           3.       The Court provisionally certifies, for settlement purposes only, a class  
25 defined as: All persons in the United States who purchased the following Hyland's  
26 products on or after March 8, 2008: (i) Cold 'n Cough 4 Kids, (ii) Cough Syrup with  
27 100% Natural Honey, (iii) Sniffles 'n Sneezes 4 Kids, (iv) Cold Relief Strips 4 Kids  
28

1 with Zinc, (v) Nighttime Cold 'n Cough 4 Kids, (vi) Complete Flu Care 4 Kids, (vii)  
2 Baby Teething Gel, (viii) Baby Cough Syrup, (ix) Baby Gas Drops, (x) Baby Infant  
3 Earache Drops, and (xi) Baby Nighttime Tiny Cold Syrup. Excluded from the Class  
4 are: (a) Hyland's employees, officers and directors, (b) persons or entities who  
5 purchased the Products for the purpose of re-sale, (c) retailers or re-sellers of the  
6 Products, (d) governmental entities, (e) persons who timely and properly exclude  
7 themselves from the Class as provided herein, and (f) the Court, the Court's  
8 immediate family, and Court staff.

9         4. The requirements for certification of the Settlement Class under Fed. R.  
10 Civ. P. 23(a), and (b)(3) have been satisfied for settlement purposes. The Court  
11 finds, for settlement purposes, that: (a) the Settlement Class is defined by objective  
12 criteria and ascertainable; (b) the numerosity requirement is satisfied; (c) there are  
13 questions of law and fact that are common to the Settlement Class, and those  
14 questions of law and fact common to the Settlement Class predominate over any  
15 questions affecting any individual Settlement Class Member; (d) the claims of the  
16 Plaintiffs are typical of the claims of the Settlement Class they seek to represent for  
17 purposes of settlement; (e) a class action is superior to other available means of  
18 adjudicating this dispute; (f) and Plaintiffs and Class Counsel are adequate  
19 representatives of the Class. *See Forcellati v. Hyland's Inc.*, 2014 WL 1410264  
20 (C.D. Cal. Apr. 9, 2014).

21         5. The Court provisionally appoints Plaintiffs Enzo Forcellati and Lisa  
22 Roemmich as Class Representatives of the Settlement Class.

23         6. The Court provisionally appoints Bursor & Fisher, P.A., Vozzolo LLC,  
24 and Faruqi & Faruqi, LLP and their counsel as Class Counsel.

25         7. Since the Settlement Agreement set forth in the parties' Stipulation of  
26 Settlement is within the range of reasonableness and possible Final Approval, Class  
27  
28

1 Notice Should be provided to the Settlement Class pursuant to the Stipulation of  
2 Settlement, as follows:

3 a. On or before \_\_\_\_\_, the Settlement Administrator shall  
4 cause a copy of the Short Form notice to be sent by email to all class members for  
5 whom email addresses are identified.

6 b. On or before \_\_\_\_\_, the Settlement Administrator shall  
7 cause a Postcard Notice to be sent by regular mail to all class members for whom the  
8 parties do not have a valid email address but do have a mailing address.

9 c. On or before \_\_\_\_\_, Class Counsel shall cause a copy of the  
10 Long Form Notice, in both English and Spanish, to be posted on a dedicated website  
11 together with links to important case documents, such as the Preliminary Approval  
12 Order, this Stipulation of Settlement, the Consolidated Amended Class Action  
13 Complaint, Defendants' Answer to Consolidated Amended Class Action Complaint,  
14 and any Second Amended Class Action Complaint;

15 d. Class Counsel shall register [www.HylandsLawsuit.com](http://www.HylandsLawsuit.com) for notice  
16 purposes, along with several additional domains that will mirror and/or link to that  
17 website, including [www.HylandsClassAction.com](http://www.HylandsClassAction.com). Class members will be directed  
18 to the website by hyperlinks embedded in the email version of the Short Form Notice  
19 and by references in both the Short Form and Postcard Notices. The  
20 [www.HylandsLawsuit.com](http://www.HylandsLawsuit.com) website will allow Class Members to submit Claim  
21 Forms online and will contain information relevant to Class Members, including but  
22 not limited to the Long Form Notice, all applicable deadlines, the Stipulation of  
23 Settlement, Class Notice, a downloadable Claim Form, all papers filed by the parties  
24 in support of the proposed Settlement Agreement (including Plaintiffs' anticipated  
25 motion for a Fee and Expense Award), orders of the Court pertaining to the  
26 Stipulation of Settlement, and contact information for the Settlement Administrator  
27 for a toll-free telephone number, e-mail, and U.S. mail.

1 e. On or before \_\_\_\_\_, the Settlement Administrator shall  
2 undertake Publication Notice, which means publication of the Short Form Notice in  
3 the National Edition of USA Today once a week for four consecutive weeks, and a  
4 Facebook campaign targeting people who have expressed an interest in or “like”  
5 pages related to Hyland’s, homeopathy, homeopathic medicine, and wellness as well  
6 as those people who have expressed an interest in or “like” pages related to  
7 parenting.

8 f. The Notice Period shall run from \_\_\_\_\_ to \_\_\_\_\_.

9 8. The Court approves the Class Notice forms, including the Long Form  
10 Notice, the Short Form Notice, and the Postcard Notice, which are substantially in  
11 the form attached to the Stipulation of Settlement.

12 9. The Court determines that the Notice of the Settlement Agreement and  
13 of the Fairness Hearing, as set forth in the parties’ Stipulation of Settlement,  
14 complies with all legal requirements, including but not limited to the Due Process  
15 Clause of the United States Constitution. Thus, the Court directs that Class Notice  
16 shall be given to the Class as provided herein and in Section V of the parties’  
17 Stipulation of Settlement.

18 10. Settlement Class Members will have until the Claim Deadline, on  
19 \_\_\_\_\_, to submit a Claim Form.

20 11. If a Settlement Class Member wishes to exclude himself or herself from  
21 the Settlement Agreement, that Settlement Class Member will have until the Opt-Out  
22 Date, on \_\_\_\_\_, to submit a valid Request for Exclusion in the manner  
23 set forth in Section VI of the Stipulation of Settlement. All Settlement Class  
24 Members who do not timely submit a valid Request for Exclusion will be bound by  
25 the Final Order and Final Judgment, and enjoined from bringing or prosecuting any  
26 action relating to the Released Claims.

1           12.     The Court appoints KCC Class Action Services, LLC, a well-qualified  
2 and experienced claims administrator, as the Settlement Administrator.

3           13.     The Court will hold a Fairness Hearing on \_\_\_\_\_ at \_\_\_\_\_  
4 to determine whether the Settlement Agreement should be approved as fair,  
5 reasonable, and adequate, and to determine whether a Final Order and Final  
6 Judgment should be entered. The Fairness Hearing will be held at the United States  
7 District Court for the Central District of California, Edward R. Roybal Federal  
8 Building and United States Courthouse, 255 East Temple Street, Courtroom 880, Los  
9 Angeles, California 90012-3332, in Court Room 650.

10          14.     The deadline for the parties to file and serve papers in support of their  
11 application for final approval of the Settlement Agreement, as well as Class  
12 Counsel's motion for fees, costs, and incentive awards, shall be on \_\_\_\_\_.  
13 Class Counsel will also include contemporaneous time records sufficient to enable  
14 the court to do a lodestar analysis.

15          15.     At least seven calendar days prior to the Fairness Hearing, Class  
16 Counsel shall prepare or cause the Settlement Administrator to prepare a list of the  
17 persons who have excluded themselves in a valid and timely manner from the  
18 Settlement Class, and Class Counsel shall file that list with the Court.

19          16.     Any objections by any Settlement Class Member to the certification of  
20 the Settlement Class or to the approval of the proposed Settlement Agreement set  
21 forth in the parties' Stipulation of Settlement shall be heard and any papers submitted  
22 in support of said objections shall be considered by the Court at the Fairness Hearing  
23 only if, on or before the Objection Deadline, on \_\_\_\_\_, such objector files  
24 with the Court a written objection and notice of the objector's intention to appear,  
25 and otherwise complies with the requirements set for in Section VI of the Stipulation  
26 of Settlement.

1           17.    The deadline for the parties to file and serve any response to any timely  
2 objections shall be on \_\_\_\_\_.

3           18.    The parties shall, pursuant to the terms and conditions of the Stipulation  
4 of Settlement, take all necessary and appropriate steps to establish the terms and  
5 conditions of the Stipulation of Settlement and this Preliminary Approval Order.

6           19.    Pending the Fairness Hearing, all proceedings, other than the  
7 proceedings necessary to carry out or enforce the terms and conditions of the  
8 Agreement and the Preliminary Approval Order in the Consolidated Action are  
9 stayed, and Class Members are enjoined from bringing or prosecuting any action  
10 relating to the Released Claims.

11  
12 **IT IS SO ORDERED.**

13  
14 Dated: \_\_\_\_\_

By: \_\_\_\_\_  
    Hon. George H. King  
    United States District Judge